```
0001
1
                                                    1
2
 3
    SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
    COUNTY OF KINGS
 4
 5
 6
                         Plaintiff,
                                    Index No.:
 7
                  -against-
                                       /06
8
9
10
                        Defendant.
11
     ----x
12
                        100 Church Street
13
                        New York, New York
14
                        April 4, 2007
                        10:30 a.m.
15
16
17
                  EXAMINATION BEFORE TRIAL OF
           , on behalf of the Defendant herein,
18
    taken by the Plaintiff, held at the above-mentioned
19
    time and place, pursuant to Order, before a Notary
20
21
    Public of the State of New York.
22
23
24
25
0002
1
                                                    2
2
3
    A P P E A R A N C E S:
4
 5
                THE LAW OFFICE OF GERALD M. OGINSKI, LLC
 6
                Attorney for Plaintiff
                     25 Great Neck Road
 7
                      Suite 4
                     Great Neck, New York 11021
8
                BY: GERALD M. OGINSKI, ESQ.
9
10
                      , ESQ.
                Attorneys for Defendant
11
                     100 Church Street
12
                     New York, New York 10007
13
                BY:
                            , ESQ.
14
15
16
17
```

```
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
0003
1
                                                       3
2
                         STIPULATIONS
3
           IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED, by and between the
     attorneys for the respective parties hereto, that:
 5
           All rights provided by the C.P.L.R., and Part
     221 of the Uniform Rules for the Conduct of
 6
 7
     Depositions, including the right to object to any
8
     question, except as to form, or to move to strike any
 9
     testimony at this examination is reserved; and in
10
     addition, the failure to object to any question or to
11
     move to strike any testimony at this examination
12
     shall not be a bar or waiver to make such motion at,
13
     and is reserved to, the trial of this action.
14
           This deposition may be sworn to by the witness
15
     being examined before a Notary Public other than the
16
     Notary Public before whom this examination was begun,
17
     but the failure to do so or to return the original of
     this deposition to counsel, shall not be deemed a
18
19
     waiver of the rights provided by Rule 3116, C.P.L.R.,
20
     and shall be controlled thereby.
21
           The filing of the original of this deposition
22
     is waived.
23
           IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED, a copy of this
2.4
     examination shall be furnished to the attorney for
25
     the witness being examined without charge.
0004
1
2
                  , having first been duly
3
          sworn by Jennifer Brennan, the Notary Public,
 4
          was examined and testified as follows:
 5
     EXAMINATION BY
 6
     MR. OGINSKI:
 7
                 Would you state your name for the record,
 8
     please?
 9
           Α
10
                 Would you state your address for the
           Q
11
     record, please?
12
                               , New York 11206.
           Α
13
                       MR. OGINSKI: By counsel,
14
                 you'll accept service for him?
15
                       MS.
                            : As long as he
16
                 continues to be employed by
17
18
                      . If he's no longer
19
                 employed, we will provide a last
20
                 known address to you.
21
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                     Thank you.
22
                 Good morning, Doctor, where do you
23
     currently work?
```

```
24
           Α
                        Hospital.
25
           Q
                 In what capacity?
0005
                                                    5
1
2
                 Special fellow.
           Α
3
                 In what field?
           Q.
           Α
                 In the department of surgery and division
 5
     of orthopedics.
 6
                 And how long have you been there as a
           Q
7
     fellow?
8
                 August of 1996.
9
           Q.
                 When you say you are a special fellow,
10
     what do you mean by that?
                 It's just a title.
11
           Α
12
                 And can you describe that title for me,
           Q
13
     please?
14
                 It's a position called as a house
     physician, where I assist in the management of
15
     patients, helping the attendings in whatever they
16
17
     want, under their guidance.
18
           Q
                 Are you considered a house officer?
19
           Α
                 Yes.
20
                 Are you an attending physician?
           Q
21
           Α
                 No.
22
                 As a fellow, are you still in training?
           0
23
                 I'm not in any training.
           Α
                 In August of 2005, what was your title at
2.4
25
           Hospital?
0006
1
                                                     6
 2
                 Same, special fellow.
           Α
 3
                 And describe for me what your job duties
 4
     entail as a special fellow?
 5
                 I examine patients and discuss the
 6
     management with the attending, whoever is
 7
     responsible, and follow their directions, help them
8
     in performing surgery and assisting them to do the
 9
     surgery and follow-up on all patients in-house, so
10
     that if there is any problem, I can take care and
11
     convey to the attending what I have done and what
12
     needs to be done. They give me further advice if
13
     needed.
14
                 Do you perform these duties in both the
15
     department of surgery and the department of
16
     orthopedics?
17
                 Mainly orthopedics.
           Α
18
           Q
                 Are you licensed to practice medicine in
19
     the State of New York?
20
           Α
                 Yes.
21
           Q
                 When were you licensed, approximately?
22
                 I'm not one hundred percent, around '93,
           Α
23
     94.
24
                 Has your license to practice ever been
25
     suspended?
0007
                                                    7
1
 2
           Α
                 No.
 3
           Q
                 Has it ever been revoked?
```

```
No.
           Α
5
                 Do you have a license to practice in any
           Q
6
     other state?
7
           Α
                 No.
8
                 Do you remember
                                   , the
           0
9
     gentleman involved in this case?
10
           Α
                 The name rings, but I'm not one hundred
11
     percent sure.
12
                Do you recall treating Mr.
           Q
13
     August or September of 2005?
14
                I have to look into the chart.
15
                Separate and apart from your review of
16
     the chart, do you have any independent memory of
17
     actually treating him?
18
               No, I don't have recall about him,
19
     without looking at the chart.
20
                All of my questions are going to relate
21
     to the August 2005 time period, unless I indicate
22
     otherwise.
23
                 Were there occasions when you would be
24
     assigned to see and treat patients in the emergency
25
     room at
                  Hospital?
0008
1
                                                    8
2
                 Yes.
           Α
3
                 In addition to seeing and treating
     patients in the emergency room, did you also see and
 5
     treat patients in the orthopedic clinic?
 6
           Α
                 Yes.
 7
                 What is angulation, in terms of a
           Q.
 8
     fracture?
9
                 Angulation is a deviation of the
           Α
10
     fragments from an anatomical position.
11
           Q
                From a what position?
12
                 Anatomical position.
           Α
13
                And what does the term rotation mean,
14
     again in terms of a fracture?
15
                It's a misalignment of the two fragments
          Α
16
     from the anatomical position.
17
               When a patient came in with a fracture to
18
            Hospital emergency room, was it customary
19
     for a physician, such as yourself or another
20
     physician in the emergency room, to obtain X-rays of
21
     a patient's ulna and radius, if that was the area
22
     they were complaining of?
23
          Α
                Unless they do the X-rays, you can never
     say, so it is customary to do X-rays.
24
25
                I should have said, is it the standard of
           Q
0009
1
 2
     care in order to rule out a fracture, to take an
 3
     X-ray of a patient's affected area of where they are
 4
     complaining of?
 5
           Α
                 Yes.
 6
                 And in the course of your training,
 7
     Doctor, have you had occasion to review and read
 8
    X-rays?
 9
           Α
                 Yes.
```

```
10
               In August of 2005, if an X-ray was taken
11
     of a patient in the emergency room, was it customary
     for you to read and evaluate and interpret that
12
13
     patient's X-rays?
14
                 Personally I do it, but it is done by the
           Α
15
     radiologist.
16
                 Let me ask it a different way. The
           0
17
     radiologist reads and interprets films; correct?
18
               Yes.
19
                        Hospital employed radiologists
20
     to read and interpret X-rays; correct?
21
22
                 And patients who were seen in the
23
     emergency room, who had X-rays taken, those X-rays
     were customarily interpreted by radiologists within a
24
25
     certain time period; correct?
0010
1
                                                    10
 2
           Α
                 Yes.
 3
                 In addition and separate and apart from
 4
     the radiologists evaluating a particular X-ray for a
 5
     potential fracture, you indicated that you would also
     review the patient's X-rays; correct?
 7
           Α
                 Yes.
                 Were there times where you would consult
9
     with the radiologist, to discuss and evaluate a
10
     particular X-ray?
11
                 If I need their help, I do.
12
           0
                 And in the course of your training, have
13
     you come to learn how to diagnose fractures, based
14
     upon review and evaluation of X-rays?
15
                 Yes.
           Α
16
           Q
                 Did you see
                                 in the
17
     emergency room of
                              Hospital on August 15,
18
     2005?
19
                 I have to look into the chart.
           Α
20
                 Please, go ahead.
           Q
                 I did see him.
21
           Α
22
                 And how was it that you came to see him?
           Q
23
                The emergency room physician calls for a
24
     consult to see the patient, so I go down and see the
25
     patient and evaluate him.
0011
1
                                                    11
 2
                 At the time you were called down to see
 3
                  , had X-rays already been taken of his ulna
     and radius?
                 They are done already.
 5
           Α
 6
                 And as part of your examination of
           0
7
                  , did you also review his X-rays on
     Mr.
8
     August 15th?
9
                 I did.
           Α
10
                 At the time that you examined Mr.
11
     was anyone with you at the same time, whether a
12
     resident, a fellow, attending or anybody else?
13
                 I'm not sure.
           Α
1 4
                 After you completed your examination of
15
            , did you have any discussion with any
```

```
16
    attending about --
17
                             : Have we
                      MS.
18
                 established that an examination was
19
                 done?
20
                      MR. OGINSKI:
                                     I'll get to
21
                 that. He wrote a note.
22
                      MS.
                                     Let's
                                :
23
                 establish that.
2.4
                      MR. OGINSKI:
                                     Withdraw the
25
                 question.
0012
1
                                                  12
2
                      Let's mark the chart as
3
                Plaintiff's Exhibit 1.
4
                       (At this time, the chart was
5
                received and marked Plaintiff's
 6
                Exhibit 1, for identification, as of
 7
                this date.)
8
                You're looking in the patient's chart,
9
     which has been marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 1, for
10
     identification, and is that a note that you wrote?
11
               I wrote this note.
12
                And did you write that note in the
13
     ordinary course of doing your business after
14
     conducting an examination of Mr. ?
15
               Customary is to write after everything is
16
     done to the patient.
17
          Q Now, before you actually examined or saw
18
    Mr. , did you review any of the notes that
19
     anyone else had written in the chart before you
20
     arrived?
21
                In other words, the ER notes; did you
22 read the triage notes, any nurse's notes or any other
23
    physicians who made entries in the patient's chart?
24
                I don't remember.
25
                Is it customary for you to do that, to
0013
1
 2
    review the patient's chart prior to seeing and
 3
    examining them?
 4
          Α
                I always do that.
 5
          Q.
                I'm sorry?
 6
               I always do that. It's customary.
          Α
 7
               Do you know a Dr.
          Q
8
                Yes, I know him.
          Α
9
                Who is Dr.
          Q
10
                He's one of the emergency room attending
          Α
11
    physicians.
12
                And in the top right portion of your
13
    consultation note, it says "signature of attending,"
14
    is that Dr.
                        name that appears in that
15
     space?
16
                Below the last, it looks like
17
                      MS.
                                : Do you know
18
                 that for sure?
19
                      THE WITNESS: I believe.
20
                And as far as you know, he was the
21
     emergency room attending at the time?
```

```
22
                 From the chart, that's what I recall. I
         Α
23
     think so.
24
                 Was he an orthopedic attending, if you
25
     know?
0014
1
2
                 He's not an orthopedic attending.
          Α
3
                 To your knowledge, is Dr.
           Q
                                                 still
4
     working at
                       Hospital?
5
                 I believe he's still working.
          A
6
           Q
                 Αt
                          Hospital?
7
          Α
                 Yes.
8
           Q
                 And do you know when it is that
9
     Dr.
                  put his name to this consult report that
10
    you are --
11
                                 :
                                      I'm going to
                       MS.
12
                 object.
13
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      What's the
14
                 objection?
15
                       MS.
                                 :
                                      This is
16
                               signature. This is
                 Dr.
17
                 not his signature.
18
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      This is his
19
20
                                : I'm not going
21
                 to permit him to answer that. If
22
                 you want to depose Dr.
23
                 that's a different story. I'm not
24
                 going to permit him to answer.
25
                       MR. OGINSKI: I want to know
0015
1
2
                 who made the entry on his note. I
3
                 want to know when he made --
4
                       MS. : Do you want to
5
                 talk to him about his notes? As to
6
                 what anyone else wrote --
7
                       MR. OGINSKI: I disagree. I
                 can ask him anything about \bar{\mbox{the}}
8
9
                 chart, which I will do that, but I
10
                 want to know when that signature
11
                 appeared on his consult note.
                                 : Do you know
12
                       MS.
13
                 that?
14
                       THE WITNESS: It's been so
15
                 long, I don't remember exactly.
16
                 Customarily, when does an attending make
17
     an entry on a chart involving consultation?
18
                Before I wrote anything on the chart.
19
                And do you know why that's done, why the
20
     doctor's name appears before you write your note, as
21
     opposed to after?
22
                 (No response.)
          Α
23
                In other words, is he the one requesting
           Q.
24
     the consult?
25
                He's the one requesting the consult.
0016
1
                                                   16
```

```
Did you have a conversation with
 3
                after you examined Mr.
     Dr.
                 I can't recall.
           Α
 5
                 Is there anything in your notes or
           Q
 6
     anything in the chart that you reviewed, that would
 7
     refresh your memory as to whether you did or did not
     talk to Dr.
                        about this patient's examination?
9
          Δ
                Nothing in my note says about that.
10
                 At the bottom of your note, Doctor, can
           Q.
11
     you look please to see whether there is any notation
12
     you made that indicates who you discussed this
13
     examination with, if anyone, other than the patient?
14
                Right at the beginning of the note, which
15
     I started writing, it says that I discussed with
16
     Dr.
17
           Q
                 Who is Dr.
18
                 He's the orthopedic surgeon on call.
           Α
19
                 Did you reduce Mr.
           Q.
                                           fracture?
20
           Α
                As per the note, yes.
21
                 And what is reduction, Doctor?
           Q
22
                 Reduction is trying to get as near
          Α
23
     anatomical position as possible of the fragments.
24
                 When a patient comes in with an ulna and
25
     radius fracture and the diagnosis is made on X-ray,
0017
1
 2
     what are the treatment options that are generally
 3
     available to the patient who has such a fracture?
 4
                       MS.
                               : Are we talking
 5
                 about this patient or general?
 6
                       MR. OGINSKI: In general.
7
                       MS.
                                      In general,
8
                 any ulna and radius fracture.
9
                 Combined ulna and radius fracture,
10
     generally, what are the treatment options available?
                It depends on the condition of the
11
12
    patient. We can go either closed or open reduction.
13
                Describe for me what is an open
          Q
14
     reduction, please?
15
                It's a surgical procedure where we make
16
     incisions, put the bones together and put plates and
17
     screws or whatever, hardware inside.
18
                If the patient does need an open
19
     reduction, are you the individual who performs such
20
     surgery?
21
          Α
                I assist in doing the surgery to the
22
     attending, whoever is on call.
23
                Who makes the decision as to whether the
24
     patient requires either closed reduction or open
25
     reduction?
0018
1
                                                    18
 2
                 The attending on call.
          Α
 3
                 In this particular case, did Dr.
          Q.
     come to see and examine this particular patient?
 5
          Α
                 I don't recall.
 6
                 Is there anything in the notes that you
     have reviewed in preparation for today, that would
```

```
suggest to you that Dr.
                                     came and saw and
9
    examined Mr. , at any time before you made your
10
    determination he would receive closed reduction?
         A All I can say is I got in touch with
11
12
                   and discussed the case and followed his
13
    instructions, gave the options to the patient and
14
    that's it.
15
          Q
                Maybe my question wasn't clear. Is there
16
    anything in the notes that you have reviewed, to
17
    suggest that Dr.
                      saw and examined this
18
    patient?
19
          Α
                No.
20
          0
               And at the time that you spoke to
21
         about Mr. , had he seen or examined
    Dr.
22
    Mr.
23
                By the time I examined and discussed with
          Α
24
    him, no.
25
                And to your knowledge, Doctor, after you
          Q.
0019
1
 2
                           , did you then perform your
     spoke with Dr.
 3
     closed reduction of the fracture?
 4
          Α
               Yes.
 5
               And whose decision was it, in this
 6
    particular case, as to what treatment Mr.
7
    would receive, closed reduction compared to open
8
    reduction?
9
                In other words, was this a decision that
10
    you had made or was it a decision that Dr.
11
    had made or somebody else?
12
         A It's a discussion between me and
13
    Dr.
14
               And at the time that you spoke to
15
                , do you know whether he reviewed the
16
    patient's X-rays?
17
               Did he review personally, I'm not hundred
    percent -- I don't know about that. But whatever he
18
    knew, is what I told him, exactly what I said.
19
20
          Q And to your knowledge, Doctor, was
21
                present, physically present within the
22
    hospital at the time that you spoke to him about
23
    Mr.
24
          Α
                No.
25
          Q
               He was not or you do not know?
0020
1
                                                 20
2
               He's not in the hospital.
          Α
3
               And was Dr.
          Q.
                                  employed by
    Hospital at that time?
5
         Α
                Yes.
6
          Q
                What was it that you told Dr.
7
                ?
     about Mr.
8
          Α
                I can't recall exact words.
9
                What type of fracture did you tell him
          Q.
10
    that Mr.
                    had?
11
         Δ
               Both bone fractures of the forearm.
12
               And in describing the fractures, this is
13
    of the left arm; correct?
```

```
14
         Α
                Yes.
15
                And by the way, which hand was dominant
          Q
16
                 ?
     on Mr.
17
                 I don't remember.
          Α
18
                As part of your history, do you
19
     customarily ask a patient who comes in with hand or
     arm trauma, which hand is dominant for them?
20
21
                Yes, we do ask them.
          Α
22
                And in the course of your examination and
23
     taking a history, did you record that information
24
     anywhere on your note?
25
          Α
                 I did not.
0021
1
                                                   21
2
                 Did you ask that particular information
3
     of Mr.
                 in this case?
 4
                As a customary, I should have asked him,
 5
     but I can't recall.
 6
                And is there anything in your note which
 7
     would confirm or tell you otherwise, as to which hand
8
     was dominant for him?
9
                I need to see other's notes.
          Α
10
                In preparation for today, Doctor, did you
11
    review Mr.
                         chart that you have in front of
12
    you?
13
                 No.
           Δ
14
           Q
                 Did you review any medical records in
15
    preparation for today?
16
          Α
                 No.
                 Is this the first time that you have seen
17
    your consultation note since August 15, 2005?
18
19
          Α
                Yes.
20
                Before starting this morning, had you
           Q
21
     reviewed your own note?
22
                Yes.
23
                Had you reviewed any other notes, either
24
     in the clinic or anything else that you may have done
25
     for Mr.
0022
1
 2
               I seen one more note of mine, that I
          Α
 3
     reviewed that.
 4
                And when you evaluated Mr.
 5
     fracture, did you determine whether there was any
 6
     angulation associated with the fracture?
 7
          A
                (No response.)
8
                Are you referring to your notes?
9
                I'm referring to my note.
10
                 Separate and apart from your note,
     Doctor, do you have any memory as to whether there
11
12
     was any angulation associated with this fracture,
13
    before you reduced it?
14
          Α
15
                 Is there anything in your note which
16
     would suggest that there was any angulation?
17
               It doesn't suggest.
18
                Is there anything in your note which
19
     would suggest that there was a rotational component
```

```
to the fracture?
20
21
                 It doesn't.
          Α
22
                 When you reviewed the patient's X-rays,
23
     did you make a comment in your consultation note as
24
     to your opinion as to what those X-rays showed?
25
          A I made a comment here, "X-ray, left
0023
1
                                                    23
 2
     forearm shows fracture, non-displaced at junction of
 3
    middle and distal third."
 4
                And how many films were you referring to?
 5
           Α
                 Customarily at least two films would be
 6
     done.
 7
                 An AP film?
           0
8
                 AP and lateral film.
           Α
9
                 Do you identify which films it is that
10
     you are referring to which best show the fracture or
     are you just saying in general, that this is what
11
12
    both of those films showed?
13
                That's what both of the films showed.
          Α
14
                 At the time that you reviewed the film,
15
     Doctor, had the radiologist, to your knowledge,
16
     already reviewed the films?
17
                 I can't recall that.
18
                 Generally, in August of 2005, how long
19
     did it take for a radiologist to review films that
20
    were taken in the emergency room?
21
                       MS.
                                  : Objection.
22
                 You're asking him to answer a
23
                 question of the radiologist?
                 I'm asking based upon your experience of
25
                      Hospital for many years in the
     working at
0024
1
 2
     emergency room, how long did it take the radiologist
3
     to read films taken in the emergency room?
                I cannot give you an answer for that. I
 5
     don't work in the emergency room.
 6
                You had indicated that you had treated
 7
     patients in the emergency room at
                                              Hospital;
8
     correct?
9
                 The consult. The emergency room
10
     attending calls me for a consult. I go there. By
     that time, it's already done.
11
12
                What's already done?
13
                 The X-rays are done. And if the
14
     radiologist is there, that's fine. If not, they call
15
    me for evaluation and to evaluate and then do. I
16
     don't remember or recall what happened on this
17
    patient.
18
                 Did you have a conversation with the
19
     radiologist about these particular films?
20
                 I don't recall.
          Α
21
                 If you had spoken with the radiologist,
22
     would you have made a note of that in your chart?
23
           Α
                Yes.
24
                 And is there anything in your note to
25
     indicate that you had a conversation with any
```

```
0025
                                                    25
 1
 2
     radiologist?
 3
                 No. Sometimes we don't. If we don't
     have any, what do you call, discrepancy in our
 5
     diagnosis, we don't note it.
                 Did Dr.
 6
                                     come to see Mr.
 7
     any time after you had reduced Mr.
                                                     fracture,
 8
     while he was still in the emergency room?
 9
                 Still in the emergency room, I'm not -- I
10
     don't think so. I can't say one hundred percent, but
11
     I don't think so.
12
                 Doctor, where did you go to medical
13
     school?
14
                 In India.
           Α
15
           Q
                 Where?
16
                               , Medical
           Α
17
     College.
18
           0
                 When did you graduate?
19
                 19
           Α
20
                 And after completing medical college in
21
     India, what did you do, as far as your medical
22
     training?
23
                 I worked in a private institution back in
           Α
24
     India until 1998. I'm sorry, 1988.
25
                 What was the name of that institution?
0026
1
                                                    26
 2
           Α
 3
                 What type of institution was that?
                 They treat generally everyone, mainly
           Α
 5
     general surgery, urology, OB/GYN and trauma.
 6
                 And after 1988, what did you do?
           Q
 7
                 Came over to the United States in 1988,
 8
     December and I joined in
                                            University as a
 9
     research assistant in clinical pharmacology.
10
                 For how long?
           Q
11
                 Until 1990, June. And in July of 1990, I
           Α
12
     joined in
                         Hospital as a general surgery
13
     resident until 19
14
                 You started in what year?
           Q
15
           Α
                 90.
16
           0
                 General surgery program, that's typically
17
     a five-year program?
                 It's a five-year program.
18
           Α
19
                 And can you explain how it took you six
           Q
20
     years to complete?
21
                 General surgery is not something that
           Α
22
     it's done in five years or four years or three years.
23
     It depends upon the program and the directors, which
24
     they may ask you to repeat the program again, the
25
     same year again.
0027
 1
                                                    27
                 Did that happen with you, where you
 3
     repeated a particular year again?
                I just -- I don't remember which year
 4
     they made me repeat or not because they never told
```

```
me. I just worked through and then --
7
          Q Regardless of which year, is it your
     recollection at some point during your training, your
8
9
     residency training in general surgery, you were asked
10
    to repeat a year?
11
                They never told me anything. I just
12
     continued and I didn't even finish the program, let
13
    me put it that way.
14
               Is there a particular reason you didn't
15
     finish the program?
16
               There were too many senior residents who
17
    needs to finish up. And I was not sure when I'm
18
    going to finish the program, so I just quit the
19
    program.
20
                And what did you do after 1996?
          Q
21
               I joined , under surgery
          Α
22
    department in orthopedic division.
23
               Have you ever done any orthopedic
     Q.
24
    residency?
25
         A
                No.
0028
1
                                                  28
2
               And when you joined
                                         , you joined,
3
     as you said, as a special fellow?
                Yes.
          Α
5
                The training you received at Harlem
6
    Hospital, were you let go at the end of 1996 or was
7
     it a decision you made to leave and go elsewhere?
              It was a decision I made to leave.
8
          Α
9
                Are you board certified in any field of
          Q.
10
    medicine?
11
          Α
                No.
12
                Are you board eligible in any field of
          Q
13
    medicine?
14
                No.
          Α
15
               Have you published any articles in any
          Q.
16 peer review journals?
17
               Not in the United States.
          Α
18
                Have you ever testified before?
          Q
19
                Yes.
          Α
20
                Under what circumstances?
          Q
21
          Α
                Same like you.
22
          Q
                How many times?
23
                      MS. :
                                     Objection.
24
                      MR. OGINSKI:
                                     It's a proper
25
                question.
0029
1
                                                  29
2
                                     Objection.
                               :
3
                      MR. OGINSKI:
                                     What is the
4
                objection?
 5
                                     What's the
                      MS.
                               :
 6
                basis for the question?
 7
                      MR. OGINSKI:
                                   I need to know
                what his background is. I need to
9
                know whether he ever testified as an
10
                expert or a fact witness or as a
11
                defendant.
```

```
12
                               : He's not a
13
                 defendant in this case and he's
14
                 testifying.
15
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                     He's a fact
16
                 witness and he's employed by the
17
                 defendant. So I'm just asking about
18
                 his background.
19
                 How many times, Doctor?
           Q
20
                                      Objection.
                       MS.
                                 :
21
                 I'm directing him not to answer the
22
                 question.
                                     Counsel, you
23
                       MR. OGINSKI:
24
                 can't direct any witness not to
25
                 answer any question. Under the new
0030
                                                    30
1
 2
                 rules of the court, you are
 3
                 prohibited from telling the witness
 4
                 not to answer, unless it is
 5
                 privileged. And absent any
 6
                 privilege objection, he's required
 7
                 to answer, with the proviso that you
 8
                 still have your objection.
 9
                                      You can answer
                       MS.
                                  :
10
                 over my objection. Do you know how
11
                 many times you testified before?
12
                 Probably two or three times.
13
                 And have you ever testified as an expert
14
     physician in any capacity, either in medical
15
     malpractice, injury cases, workers' compensation or
16
     anything else?
17
           Α
                 Once.
18
                 And in what capacity were you testifying?
           Q
19
                 As a physician who treated the patient.
           Α
20
                 Was that a malpractice case, an injury
21
     case or something else, if you can tell me?
22
                 Injury case.
          Α
23
                And is that your entire experience of
           Q
24
     testifying, Doctor?
25
                 Yes.
           Α
0031
 1
 2
                 The two times you mentioned, was that
 3
     also questioning at a deposition or was that at
 4
     trial?
 5
           Α
                 Only once at a trial.
 6
                 Do you recall what county it was that you
           Q
 7
     were testifying in at trial?
                 Brooklyn.
           Α
 9
                 Doctor, in your
                                           Hospital residency
           Q
     training, you mentioned that there were other
10
11
     physicians who needed to finish the program and you
12
     were not given the opportunity to finish; is that
13
     correct, or am I misstating that?
14
                       MS.
                                  :
                                      You are
15
                 misstating the statement.
16
                       MR. OGINSKI: I apologize.
17
           Q
                 Can you tell me the reason again why it
```

```
is that you did not finish the general surgery
19
     residency training program?
20
                                 : I'm going to
                      MS.
                 object to that, asked and answered.
21
22
                He answered the question before.
23
                       MR. OGINSKI: I don't recall
24
                exactly what he said. I just want
25
                to clarify.
0032
1
                                                   32
2
                                     Have it read
                                 :
3
                 back, but he answered the question
                before.
5
                As part of the reasons for not finishing
 6
     the program, did it have to do with any performance
 7
     ability or inability that you had during your
8
     training?
9
          Α
                No.
10
                How many physicians were in your year in
          0
11
     the residency?
12
             I didn't understand your question.
          Α
13
                There are a certain number of surgery
14
     residents in each given year, first-year,
15
     second-year, third-year, fourth-year, how many were
16
    in your year?
17
                I do not recall.
          Α
18
                Were there any other physicians that were
19
     in the training program with you, that did not
20
     complete the program as you?
                There were, but I don't know who.
21
          Α
22
          0
                Do you know how many there were?
23
               I don't recall.
          Δ
24
                Now, when you joined
          Q
                                             Hospital,
25
     did you receive any specialized orthopedic training
0033
1
                                                   33
 2
     at the hospital?
3
               First few months I received the
          Α
4
     orthopedic training.
 5
                And that was by taking classes, by
 6
     following the orthopedic residents or the orthopedic
 7
     attendings or something else?
 8
          Α
                Following the orthopedic attendings.
 9
                How many months did you receive that
          Q
10
     training?
11
                I don't remember. And I still claim
          Α
12
    myself as still in the learning processes.
13
                Going back to Mr. , was it
          Q
14
     customary, in other words, was it the standard of
15
     care back in August at Hospital, that after
     you performed a reduction, that you take X-rays of
16
17
     the patient's affected body part to evaluate the
18
     reduction?
19
                It is customary.
          Α
20
                And why is that done?
          0
21
                To check how much of angulation
          Α
22
     correction was done, whether he needs further
23
    management. I need to know how the bone fragments
```

```
aligned.
25
                 Under what circumstances in a patient, a
           Q
0034
1
 2
     general question, under what circumstances would you
 3
     recommend a patient who had an ulna and radius
     fracture undergo an open reduction?
 5
                 It depends upon how I felt when I am
 6
     reducing the fracture and also the post-reduction
 7
     films.
8
                 Before you go ahead and manipulate and
9
     attempt to reduce a fracture in a closed fashion, I'm
10
     talking now about the decision as to whether or not
     the patient is going to receive either closed
11
12
     reduction or open reduction, what is it that will
13
     allow you to make a decision about whether this
14
    patient is going to receive an open reduction?
15
                               : I'm going to
                       MS.
16
                 object to the question. He
17
                 testified before he doesn't make the
18
                 decision, it's made by the
19
                 attending.
20
                 You certainly make a recommendation;
21
     correct, especially if you are the only orthopedic
22
     individual examining the patient; am I correct?
23
                 I don't make any recommendations. I talk
     with the attending what I found in the X-rays and
24
25
     what is the patient's condition.
0035
1
                 Are there times when the attending
 3
     physician, who is not present, asks you what do you
 4
     think, asks you for your opinion as to whether or not
 5
     you would recommend a closed reduction or open
 6
     reduction?
 7
                 Sometimes they do ask me, but I do tell
 8
     them what I felt.
9
          Q
                And --
10
                 But only after I do the closed reduction
          Α
11
    procedure, before I say anything to the attending.
12
                Doctor, is it good medical practice to do
13
     a procedure before evaluating all of your options as
14
     to whether the patient needs either closed or open
15
     reduction?
16
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      I'll withdraw
17
                 the question.
18
                 Are there instances where the patient
19
     will not be amenable to closed reduction?
20
                 There will be.
          Α
21
                 And in those instances, there may be bone
           Q
     fragments that you can clearly see on an X-ray, that
22
23
     you can see that the patient needs an open reduction
24
     to fix the fracture; correct?
25
          Α
                 Yes.
0036
1
                                                    36
 2
                 My question is, before you attempt the
     closed reduction, how do you determine whether the
```

24

```
patient needs an open reduction, compared to a closed
5
     reduction?
                 In other words, what is the distinction
7
     that's going to tell you, you know what, I'm not
     going to try closed reduction, the patient needs
9
     surgery?
10
                 As I told you, it depends on what I see
11
     in the X-ray, as well as on the body, whether his
12
     injuries -- other injuries.
               Were you familiar with the medical
13
           Q
14
     literature back in August 2005, as to the prognosis
15
     of patients who underwent closed reduction for both
16
    ulna and radius reduction?
17
                       MS.
                                      Objection.
18
                 What medical literature?
19
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      Any medical
20
                 literature.
21
                                      He's not
                       MS.
                                  :
22
                 answering. You can call the judge.
23
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      You have to
24
                 state the basis.
25
                       MS.
                                      I am directing
0037
1
                                                    37
2
                 him not to answer the question.
3
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      What is the
4
                 basis?
5
                                  : You are asking
 6
                 him a question about any medical
 7
                 literature in the entire world,
8
                 relating to what?
9
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                     He's a
10
                 practicing physician in the
11
                 department of orthopedics at
12
13
                       MS.
                                      If you want to
                                 :
14
                 ask a specific question, ask a
15
                 specific question. If you want an
16
                 answer to that question, call the
17
                 judge.
18
                       MR. OGINSKI: I'm probing his
19
                 knowledge in his field of specialty
20
                 at the time he's treating this
21
                 patient. If he knows the
22
                 literature, fine; if he doesn't,
                 fine, and I'll move on, but I'm
23
24
                 entitled to know if he knows.
25
                       MS.
                                      What
0038
1
                                                    38
2
                 literature are you talking about?
3
                 What are you referring to?
 4
                 Doctor, are there times when you will
 5
     review medical literature to educate and teach you
 6
     about certain procedures?
                I do review.
           Α
 8
                And as part of your ongoing training, is
 9
     it customary for you to read peer reviewed medical
```

```
10
     journals in your field of specialty?
11
                 It is customary.
           Α
12
                 Why do you do that?
           Q
13
                 To learn the new techniques, if anything
14
     that I can apply on the patient.
15
                 And in addition to any medical literature
           Q.
16
     that may be out there for you to read, are there also
17
     textbooks in your field of specialty, that you have
18
     available to you, that you can refer to from time to
19
     time?
20
                 Yes, we do have.
21
                 And over the course of your career, have
22
     you had the opportunity to review and look at and
     read certain textbooks in your field of medicine?
23
24
                Whenever I have a problem, I refer to
25
     them.
0039
 1
                                                    39
 2
                 And in August of 2005, what were the
 3
     textbooks that you would refer to, if needed, to
 4
     answer questions that you may have about treating a
 5
     particular orthopedic patient?
 6
                I don't remember the titles of the
 7
     textbooks.
                Were there orthopedic textbooks that you
           Q
 9
     had available to you at
                                    Hospital?
10
           Α
                Yes.
11
                 And are there certain textbooks that are
12
     more, I don't know if I should say popular, but
13
     certainly more of the standard, that a physician such
14
     as yourself would refer to, as opposed to some other
15
     type of reading material?
16
                I have no answer to that.
           Α
17
                Are there certain textbooks, if a
18
     resident was to ask you what is a good reference to
19
     review about a particular orthopedic procedure, what
20
     would you say to such a resident?
21
             I have no idea about that, for we don't
          Α
22
     have any residents in the program.
23
             If another orthopedic physician came to
          Q
24
     you and asked you what's a good orthopedic textbook
25
     to review --
0040
1
                                                    40
 2
           Α
                 I need to ask my attending.
 3
                 And in the course of your training,
 4
     Doctor, in the course of working at
                                               Hospital
     as a special fellow, what are some of the orthopedic
     textbooks that you have used to assist you?
                                      Objection,
                       MS.
                                 :
 8
                 asked and answered. He said before
 9
                 that he doesn't remember the name of
10
                 the textbooks that he reviewed.
11
                 In evaluating and treating Mr.
12
     did you refer to or review any textbooks?
13
           Α
                 I don't recall.
14
                 Were you aware of any medical literature
15
     in your field of medicine in orthopedics, that talks
```

```
about patients who had ulna and radius fractures and
17
     whether or not they should have closed or open
18
     reduction?
19
                 There are a lot of literatures which show
           Α
20
     that you can treat them both closed or open,
21
     depending on the situations.
22
                Are you familiar and can you cite for me
23
     any particular specific literature, the title,
24
     journal, volume?
25
                I don't remember.
           Α
0041
1
 2
                 In preparation for today, Doctor, did you
 3
     review any medical literature before coming here?
 4
                 No.
           Α
 5
                 Let's go please to your consult note of
     August 15, 2005. I would like you to read your
 6
 7
     entire note into the record. If there is an
 8
     abbreviation, please tell us what that abbreviation
 9
     is?
10
                 "Thank you for the referral."
           Α
11
                 If you can please start where it says
           Q
     "Question," at the top?
12
13
                 I didn't write that.
           Α
14
           Q
                 Can you read that, please?
15
                                 : No, I'm not
                       MS.
                 going to have him read that. He
16
17
                 didn't write it.
18
                 Doctor, when you come in to examine a
     patient and you see a consult request, you told me
19
20
     it's your custom to review the patient's chart.
                 Certainly, would you agree it's customary
21
22
     to review any notes on your consult note?
23
                       MS.
                                      Did you review
24
                 this note?
25
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      It doesn't
0042
1
                                                    42
 2
                 matter whether he did or didn't,
 3
                 it's his note.
 4
                       MS.
                                      It's not his
 5
                 note.
                       This is his note.
 6
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      I'm asking you
 7
                 to read that and there should be no
 8
                 objection because it's part of his
 9
                 note.
10
                                  :
                                      You are making
11
                 it part of his note.
12
                 Here is the question, do you know who
           0
13
     wrote the question?
14
                       MS.
                                      Doctor, did
15
                 you write this?
16
                       THE WITNESS: I didn't write
17
                 that.
18
                 Do you know who did?
           0
19
                       MS.
                                     Where does
2.0
                 your note start?
21
                       THE WITNESS: "Opinions,
```

16

```
thanks for the referral."
22
23
                Before you made any note, before you
     started to take pen to paper and write that, Doctor,
2.4
25
     did you read that information that appears right
0043
1
                                                   43
 2
     above it, where it says "Question"?
3
                I don't recall whether I read or not.
4
          Q
                Was it on there at the time that you made
 5
     your note?
 6
                I told you, I don't recall if it is there
          Α
7
    or not.
8
                Regardless of whether it was there, I
9
     would like you to read it as best you can, Doctor?
          A "24 year old -- 25 year old," I believe,
10
     I don't know about that, "fracture of distal," I
11
     can't make it out, "of left forearm, please
12
13
     evaluate."
14
          0
                Now, continue with your note, please?
15
          Α
                 "Thanks for referral. Patient seen and
     evaluated. Cased discussed with Dr.
16
                                           . This
17
     25 year old male patient -- I'm sorry, male presented
18
     to the ER after some bricks fell on his hand and he
19
     felt something crack in his forearm."
20
          Q
                I'm sorry, Doctor, did you indicate which
21
     arm you were referring to?
22
          Α
                No.
23
          Q
                 Go ahead, please.
24
          Α
                "No other problem. Also noted that it
25
     was deformed."
0044
1
2
               What did you mean by that, Doctor?
          Q
3
               I should have --
          Α
4
               I'm asking what you meant by that?
          0
5
          Α
               That his forearm was deformed.
 6
               Can you explain what you mean by that,
          Q
7
     when you say it's deformed?
8
             That is the history I got from him.
          Α
9
          Q
                Is that an observation that you made?
10
                Not an observation I made. That's what
          Α
11
    he told me.
12
          0
                Go ahead, please.
13
                 "On examination, alert, awake, well
14
     oriented times three. Vital signs stable, afebrile.
15
     Left forearm, no gross deformity, in posterior
16
     splint. Full range of motion in all joints.
17
    Neurovascularly fully intact. Rest of exam grossly
18
     intact. X-ray, left forearm shows fracture,
19
     non-displaced at junction of middle and distal
20
    third. Impression, fracture, both bones, left
21
     forearm."
22
                When you refer to both bones, you are
23
     referring to both the ulna and the radius?
24
          A
                Yes.
25
          Q
                Go ahead, please.
0045
                                                   45
1
```

```
"Plan, one, closed reduction; two, long
 3
     arm cast; three, post films, reduction near
     anatomical; four, discussed about surgery versus
 5
     conservative treatment, wants conservative. Five,
 6
     also discussed if fragments move, he will need open
 7
     reduction and internal fixation."
                 Tell me what you meant by that?
 9
           Α
                 When I looked at the X-ray after I put
10
     the cast, I saw it is near anatomical, that means it
11
     doesn't need further things to be done at that
12
     moment.
13
                 But whenever you put in a cast, the
14
     swelling may go down and the fracture fragments can
15
     move. If that happens, he should have a surgery,
16
     whether he likes it or not, that's my opinion to him.
17
     I also gave him the option that he should have the
18
     surgery done.
19
                 Where did you write that?
           Q.
20
           Α
                 "Discussed about surgery versus
21
     conservative, wants conservative."
22
                 What do you have after number five?
           Q
                 "Also discussed if fragments move" --
23
           Α
24
                 No, the next one.
           Q
25
                 "Six, follow-up in ortho clinic on
           Α
0046
1
                                                    46
 2
     August 19, 2005."
 3
                 And was it your intention to follow
 4
     Mr.
                in the ortho clinic?
 5
           Α
                 Yes.
 6
                 And when you wrote in the post-reduction
           0
 7
     films that there was near anatomic, you are referring
 8
     to the alignment of both the ulna and the radius?
 9
           Α
                 Yes.
10
                 Is there a difference between saying the
11
     bones are anatomically aligned, as opposed to near
12
     anatomic?
13
           Α
                 Definitely.
14
                 What is the difference?
           Q
15
                 Anatomical is perfectly, like unbroken
16
     bone. Near anatomical is it's an acceptable
17
     reduction issue, most of the bone is almost in
18
     straight alignment.
19
           Q
                 What was your rationale or reasoning for
20
     not suggesting or recommending that the patient have
21
     an open reduction to fix the fracture?
22
                 I did suggest to him and gave him the
23
     option of surgical versus conservative treatment.
24
           0
                 What did you tell him specifically?
25
                 I don't recall.
           Α
0047
 1
                                                    47
                 You told me earlier there are instances
 3
     where a patient's fracture will require open
     reduction before even a closed reduction is
 5
     attempted.
 6
                 In this particular case, do you have any
 7
     memory as to why this patient did not require or need
```

```
an open reduction initially to fix his fractures?
9
         A I cannot answer to that question
10
     appropriately because I don't have the knowledge
11
     about it.
12
                I'll ask a different one. Doctor, who is
13
14
          Α
               He's one of the other attendings.
15
               Did you ever talk to Dr. about
          Q
16
    MΥ.
17
               I don't recall.
          Α
18
               You saw Mr.
                                 in follow-up on August
          Q
19
   19th; correct?
20
          Α
               Yes.
21
               And that was in the hand clinic?
          Q
               In the orthopedic clinic.
22
          Α
               And was there an attending physician
23
24
    present in the clinic at the time that you would see
     and examine patients?
2.5
0048
1
                                                  48
2
          Α
               Yes.
3
                And was it customary for you to discuss
 4
     the patient's care with the attending, before the
    patient was discharged out of your care for that day?
          Α
                Yes.
7
          Q
               And in this particular case, did you have
     a conversation wi th an attending physician about
8
9
               ?
10
                I noted here that I discussed with
11
12
               And did Dr.
                                      accompany you during
          0
13
     your examination of this patient?
         A I don't recall.
14
15
                Did Dr.
                                  review any X-rays that
   had been taken of Mr. , from either the 15th,
16
    four days earlier or on the 19th?
17
          A I don't recall.
18
19
               Is there anything in your note which
20
     would suggest that Dr.
                            did review and see the
21
    X-rays from either the 15th or the 19th?
         A Nothing on the note.
Q Is there a note by Dr.
22
23
    August 19th, indicating that he saw and examined this
24
25
     patient?
0049
1
                                                  49
2
               I don't see a note.
3
               And does your note indicate that you had
          Q.
     spoken to Dr.
                            after you had completed your
    examination of Mr. after you had contained on August 19th?
5
         A I did write that, discussed with
7
8
               And that would be after you had done your
9
     exam?
10
                Yes.
          Α
11
                Was that while the patient is still
          Q
12
    present or is that after the patient has left?
13
     A While the patient is still there.
```

```
14
                 Going back for a moment, Doctor, to the
15
     post-reduction film of August 15th, did you review
     those films with a radiologist?
16
17
                       MS.
                                  :
                                      Objection,
18
                 asked and answered.
19
                 I don't recall.
           Α
20
                                      You asked him
21
                 that before.
22
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      I asked about
23
                 the pre-reduction films. I'm now
24
                 asking about the post-reduction
25
                 films.
0050
                                                    50
1
 2
                 I don't recall.
 3
                 At any time after August 15th, did you
 4
     see and review the X-ray reports generated by the
 5
     radiologists who interpreted the films taken on
 6
     August 15th?
 7
                I don't recall.
           Α
 8
                Let's take a look, please, at the
 9
     radiology reports for the August 15th X-rays.
10
                 Do you see the pre-reduction report? Do
11
     you see the one I'm referring to, Doctor, that's the
12
     original X-ray that was done pre-reduction?
13
                 I looked at it.
           Α
14
                 And it's signed by the radiologist,
15
           , on Monday, August 15th and timed at
     14:58, do you see that?
16
17
                 Yes.
18
                 It says, "There is a transverse fracture
           0
19
     of the distal shaft of the radius and distal shaft of
20
     the ulna"; correct?
21
           Α
                 Yes.
22
                What does it mean when it says, "There is
23
     a transverse fracture"?
24
                Transverse fracture is something
25
     transverse, across both cortexes, almost at the same
0051
1
                                                    51
 2
     level.
 3
           Q
                 And it says, "with angulation," what does
 4
     that mean?
 5
          Α
                 There is some angulation. They didn't
 6
     mention what angle of angulation is.
 7
                It also says, "There is posterior and
 8
     medial displacement of the distal fragment of the
 9
     ulna."
10
                 Yes.
           Α
                 What does that mean?
11
           Q
12
                 That means there was no contact between
           Α
13
     the two fragments.
                 I mean, I can't make exact thing, any
14
15
     displacement, it could even be still a contact is
16
     there, but there is no continuation, you can see a
17
     break.
18
                 I'm just asking you to interpret the
19
     radiologist's report.
```

```
20
                That's what I'm saying, by interpreting
21
     the radiologist's report, I cannot say whether it's a
     complete displacement or only part of it is
22
23
     displaced.
24
                 And the radiologist continues on by
25
     saying, "or the angulation is more prominent than at
0052
1
                                                    52
 2
     the level of the radius."
 3
                 What does that mean?
 4
                 Two bones are involved; one is more
5
     angulated than the other. That's all I can tell you.
                And if you can turn, please, to the
 6
7
     post-reduction film, also taken the same day.
8
                This X-ray was done when the cast has
9
     already been applied to his arm; correct?
10
                Yes.
          Α
11
                 It says that, "There is satisfactory
           Q.
12
     alignment and no gross displacement"?
13
           Α
                Yes.
14
                 Now, on August 19th when Mr.
15
     returned to the orthopedic clinic, X-rays were taken;
16
     correct?
17
          Α
                 Yes.
18
           0
                And this was done with the cast still on?
19
                 Still on.
           Α
20
                And the X-ray report generated by
                 , same day, August 19th, indicates, "A
21
    Dr.
     transverse fractures of the mid distal diaphyses of
22
23
     the ulna and radius are still seen."
                 What does that mean?
25
                 They can see the fracture line.
          Α
0053
                                                    53
1
2
                 Diaphyses, what is that?
3
                 Diaphyses is the shaft of the bone.
          Α
          0
                 Was Mr.
                                     cast removed on
 5
    August 19th?
 6
                 No.
          Α
 7
                 And did you advise him when his cast
8
     would need to be removed and changed?
9
                I don't recall what the exact words I
10
    told him.
11
          Q
                Is there anything in your note as to when
12
    he was to return to the orthopedic clinic?
13
               He was to return in one week.
          A
14
                For what purpose?
15
                For repeat X-ray.
           Α
16
                What is the purpose of taking serial
           Q
17
    X-rays over time?
                 Callus formation is needed before we can
18
19
     say anything. Until then, the fragments can move
20
     around. And we want to make sure there is no
21
    movement in the fragments.
22
                And is there any particular reason as to
23
    why this patient did not receive an open reduction to
24
     fix those fractured fragments initially?
25
                       MS.
                                 : Objection,
```

```
0054
                                                    54
 1
 2
                 asked and answered. He said he
 3
                 discussed surgery with the patient;
 4
                 he chose to be treated
 5
                 conservatively.
 6
                 Is there any reason you did not recommend
 7
     an open reduction initially on the first visit, on
 8
     August 15th?
 9
                       MS.
                                       Objection,
10
                 asked and answered. He said that he
11
                 recommended surgery and the patient
12
                 chose to be treated conservatively.
13
                 Was it your opinion that this patient
14
     needed surgery to fix the fractures on August 15th?
15
                That has been discussed with the
16
     attending on call and made the decision.
17
                That wasn't my question. Was it your
18
     opinion that this patient needed open reduction,
19
     internal fixation on August 15th?
2.0
           Α
                 Might need.
21
           Q
                 Was there a particular reason as to why
22
     open reduction was not recommended for him initially,
23
     instead of attempting closed reduction first?
24
                 The customary practice throughout the
25
     country, no patient will be given -- I mean, operated
0055
 1
 2
     right away when he comes to the emergency room. They
 3
     will be put in a splint or a cast and then taken to
     the operating room at a later date, later time.
 5
                 He had --
           Q
 6
           Α
                 Unless he has an opened wound.
 7
                 And when you saw him on August 19th, was
 8
     it your opinion at that time, that he required an
 9
     open reduction, internal fixation?
10
                 He might need.
           Α
11
                 I'm not asking about whether he might
12
     need.
13
                 As of the 19th, four days after you first
14
     saw him, was it your opinion that he required an open
15
     reduction to fix his fracture in his left ulna and
16
     radius?
17
                 My opinion, the fragments didn't move, so
           Α
18
     I gave the option back to him.
19
           Q
                 To do what?
20
                 To the patient, whether he needs an open
     reduction or wants to continue with the cast.
21
22
                 Why would you allow the patient to make
23
     the choice at that point?
                 How is the patient supposed to have this
24
25
     specialized training that you have, in order to make
0056
 1
                                                    56
 2
     an informed decision?
 3
                 This is a fracture. When the fragments
 4
     did not move, he can have either option. It's not
     necessary to operate on every fracture that you see.
```

6 How long a time period do you have to 7 make that decision, as to whether the patient needs open reduction or whether they can stay closed? 8 9 In other words, when is it that you say, okay, the patient no longer has the ability to have 10 11 an open reduction because the fracture is now healed 12 or something to that effect? 13 We had to follow-up with the X-rays and 14 see. 15 How long? Q 16 Up to two weeks. Α 17 And if there is some displacement of 18 those fracture fragments within those two weeks, then you would recommend that the patient have an open 19 20 reduction? 21 Α Yes. 22 And if after two weeks there is no 23 movement of those fracture fragments, it would still 24 be your opinion to continue this patient in a closed 25 reduction, as in a cast? 0057 57 1 2 I would give him the option. 3 How can a patient make that determination, if you just told me that if the 5 fracture fragments haven't moved, there is no need 6 for open reduction, so why would you give the patient 7 the option of that, of having open surgery? 8 Α If there is a good callus formation, I 9 won't give him any option anymore, but follow him. 10 And if in future, if he has a problem, we can correct 11 it, which was also informed to him right at the 12 beginning on the day I treated him. 13 And you have a specific memory of that? 14 I always give that to all my patients, 15 customary. 16 I'm not asking custom and practice. 0 17 asking specifically. 18 I don't recall on this patient, but my 19 customary discussion with the patient is when I 20 discuss about the surgical option and closed 21 treatment options, that if there is a problem, he 22 still would need an operation. 23 What did Dr. say about whether 0 24 this patient needed an open reduction or closed 25 reduction on August 15th? 0058 1 58 I don't recall exact words what he told 3 me, but depending on his advice, I discussed the same thing with the patient. 5 And am I correct that Dr. 6 making a decision based upon the information you are 7 providing to him? 8 Yes. Α 9 If your information is either inaccurate 10 or not complete, then he's making a decision based 11

upon either incomplete or inaccurate information;

```
12
     correct?
13
                That's a possibility.
          Α
                Can you read your note for August 19th?
14
           Q
15
                 "Distal radius ulna fracture, closed
           Α
     reduction. Send him for X-ray." I wrote something,
16
17
     which is not meant for the patient, so I scratched it
18
19
                 You made an entry in the patient's chart,
20
     which was not related to his care and treatment;
21
     correct?
22
                Yes.
23
           Q.
                It was somebody else's information?
24
          Α
                Yes.
25
           Q
                And you crossed it out?
0059
                                                   59
1
 2
                I crossed it out. Then I wrote, "X-ray,
     no change. Continue in long arm cast. Return to
 3
     clinic one week for post -- I'm sorry, repeat X-rays,
 4
 5
     discuss with Dr.
 6
          Q
                Was the patient in pain at the time of
 7
     this visit?
 8
          Α
                 I don't recall exactly but --
 9
                I'm just asking you to look at the note,
10
     Doctor, the top right portion of that, pain?
11
                It says "complaints of pain."
          Α
                And this is a form, a stamp, it says
12
           Q.
     specifically, "Are you in pain?" And there is a
13
     place for someone to check off yes or no and in this
14
15
     case, it's checked off yes; correct?
16
          Α
                Yes.
17
           Q
                As part of the initial history, it says,
18
     "complaints of pain"; correct?
19
                Yes.
20
                And the information that appears at the
21
     top portion of this page of August 19th, is that your
22
     handwriting?
23
               Not my handwriting.
24
           Q
               Do you know who customarily takes that
25
     information down?
0060
1
                                                   60
 2
                Customary, one of the nurses.
          Α
 3
                 Did you show Dr. the X-rays that
          Q
 4
     were taken on August 19th?
 5
          A I don't recall.
 6
                If you had shown him the X-rays, would
 7
     you have made a note indicating that you showed him
 8
     the X-rays?
 9
                Not routinely.
          Α
10
                 Did you have the radiologist's report of
     the August 15th X-rays in the patient's chart, when
11
12
     you saw him four days later on the 19th?
13
                 I don't recall.
          Α
14
                 Do you know how long it takes to have a
15
     patient's X-ray report placed into the patient's
16
     chart?
17
          Α
               I don't recall.
```

```
18
               Did you have any conversation with the
19
    physician who saw Mr. when he returned to the
     orthopedic clinic on August 29th?
20
21
               I don't recall.
          A
22
                Let me ask you to take a look please,
23
     Doctor, at this computerized note.
                                : What's the
24
                      MS.
25
                date on that?
0061
1
                                                  61
2
                There are a number of different dates,
    but I'm asking you to look at the bottom, where it
     indicates for the 19th of August, it says, "visit
    provider," and it has your name next to that?
 5
 6
          Α
                Yes.
 7
                Under, "preceptor and billing provider,"
          Q
     it has "
8
                       , M.D."
9
                Do you know why his name appears in that
10
    place?
11
                We routinely put Dr. as a preceptor
         Α
12
     in the clinic.
13
          Q
                Why?
14
                Because Dr.
                                      is on and off.
          Α
15
                Did you ask Dr.
                                          to come in and
          Q
16
     see Mr.
                 on August 19th?
17
                I don't recall.
         Α
18
                When Mr. returned to the clinic on
          Q
19
     August 29th, he had his cast changed from a long arm
20
     cast to a short arm cast?
21
                      MS.
                                     Objection.
                                :
22
                I haven't seen the patient, I don't know.
          Α
23
                Can you look, please, at the August 29th
          Q
24
    note?
25
                      MS.
                                 : I'm not having
0062
1
2
                him answer any questions on that.
3
                      MR. OGINSKI: What's the
4
                basis for that?
 5
                                : He did not see
                      MS.
 6
                the patient. His treatment ended
 7
                with the patient on the 19th. The
8
                deposition ends on the 19th.
9
                      MR. OGINSKI: What is your
10
                basis for not allowing him to answer
11
                any questions about the treatment
12
                the patient received after --
13
                            : He didn't see
                the patient after. I'm objecting to
14
15
                him answering any questions as of
16
                the last date that he saw the
17
                patient.
18
                      If you want to call the judge,
19
                go ahead. And I'm directing him not
                to answer any questions as to any
20
21
                treatment after the last date he saw
22
                the patient.
23
                      MR. OGINSKI: It's still an
```

```
24
                 improper objection and you know
25
                 that.
0063
1
                                                    63
2
                                      No, it's not.
                                  :
3
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      If you read the
                 rules, you know you can't make that
5
                 objection.
6
                                      I read the
                       MS.
                                  :
7
                 rules.
8
                 When you first saw Mr.
9
     August 15th, before you attempted any closed
     reduction, did you form an opinion as to whether
10
     there was any deformity to his arm?
11
               I did write in my note that there was no
12
13
     gross deformity noted and he was in a posterior
14
     splint.
15
                 And the posterior splint means it's a
    half cast?
16
17
          Α
                 Yes.
18
                 And that was changed to a full fiberglass
19
     cast?
20
                 Yes.
           Α
21
                 Under what circumstances would a cast be
22
     changed from a long arm cast to a short arm cast?
23
                       MS.
                               : Are you
24
                 talking generally or about this
25
                 patient?
0064
1
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                     Generally.
3
                 Generally it's customary that any patient
4
     who has a distal -- in the distal half of the forearm
 5
     fractures, like to put a short arm cast as soon as
 6
    possible, so that his elbow won't be frozen. But at
 7
    the same time, we also want to make sure that the
8
     fragments are not moving around when we change into a
 9
     short arm cast.
10
               Was it customary in the orthopedic
11
     clinic, that once a cast is changed, that X-rays are
12
     taken to evaluate the anatomical alignment?
13
              It all depends upon what the person,
14
     whoever saw him, feels when he is changing the cast,
15
     how the bones are, how he felt when he was changing
16
     the cast, if they were moving or not moving, things
17
     like that. Physical examination is more important to
18
     send him for X-ray or not.
19
                How can you, as a physician, know whether
20
     or not there is any mobility or movement to any
     fracture fragments, unless an X-ray is taken?
21
22
                 X-rays are not the final thing for
          Α
23
     everything.
24
                 Are there any other diagnostic tests that
25
     were available to you in August and September of
0065
1
                                                    65
 2
     2005, that would assist you in determining --
 3
               I didn't see the patient.
```

```
Let me finish the question. Are there
 5
     any diagnostic tests that were available to you in
     August and September 2005, besides an X-ray, which
 7
     would tell you whether or not there was mobility of
 8
     the fracture fragments?
 9
                 I told you, physical examination that we
10
     do at the end of \mbox{--} that's what we depend on. That's
11
     all I'm telling you.
12
                 Maybe I didn't state it clearly. You are
13
     familiar with the term diagnostic tests; correct?
14
15
                 That's separate and apart from any
16
     physical examination; right?
17
           Α
                 No.
18
                 You're saying that physical examination
           Q
19
     includes diagnostic tests?
20
                 Yes.
21
                 What diagnostic tests, during a physical
     examination, will tell you whether or not there is
22
23
     mobility of fracture fragments?
24
                I just told you, the physical examination
           Α
25
     of the patient dictates whether to do any further
0066
1
 2
     tests or not.
 3
                 That wasn't my question, Doctor. My
 4
     question was, how do you determine, without an X-ray,
 5
     whether the patient's bone fragments have moved?
 6
                 By examining the patient.
 7
                 And what is it about the examination,
 8
     which is going to tell you whether or not there has
 9
     been movement of the bone fractures?
10
                When we change the cast, you can tell
11
     whether their bones are still moving or not.
12
                 How?
13
                 By physical examination of the patient.
14
           0
                How exactly can you tell; what is it that
15
     you see, that will tell you that?
16
              If there is any deformity or when you are
17
     changing the cast, we can see whether it's moving or
18
     not, physical examination (indicating).
19
                When you take a cast off, do you
20
     intentionally attempt to manipulate the patient's
21
     fracture?
22
                 We do not attempt to change the
           Α
23
     fractures, manipulation.
24
                 How is it that you can examine or
25
     evaluate the patient during an exam and determine
0067
 1
                                                    67
 2
     whether or not there is movement of the bone
 3
     fragments?
 4
                 When we change the cast, you can easily
 5
     see if the bone fragments are moving or not.
 6
                 How?
           0
 7
                 By simple observation.
           Α
 8
                 What is it that you will see? I'm trying
 9
     to understand what you are telling me. I'm just
```

```
10
     asking you for specifics.
11
          A I can't tell you any specifics without
12
     examining a patient, that's all I can tell you.
13
          Q What is it that you would see that would
14
     suggest to you that there is movement or that the
15
     bones have moved?
16
                 When you are taking the cast off, you can
17
     see that the hand is trying to move this way and that
18
     way (indicating).
19
                When you remove a cast, is it not your
           Q
20
     intention to keep the bones again in anatomic
21
     position, so that there is no additional movement
22
    there?
23
          Α
                 We try the best to do that.
24
                So under what circumstances would you see
          Q
25
     a patient moving their hand or arm when you change a
0068
 1
                                                   68
 2
     cast?
 3
                When we are trying to take the cast off,
          Α
 4
     if there is movement in the bones, they move no
 5
     matter what care you take.
 6
                And you're saying that that clinical
          Q
 7
     examination constitutes a diagnostic test?
                I believe it is diagnostic test for me
 9
     and if I need anything further, I get something
10
     further done.
11
                 Other than X-rays, what else was
12
     available to you in August or September of 2005 to
13
     evaluate a patient's fracture?
                You are asking the same question again
14
          Α
15
     and again, that's all I can say.
16
                Other than X-ray and your clinical
           Q
17
     examination, what else was available to you, in terms
18
     of diagnostic tests?
19
                 There is nothing else.
          Α
20
           0
                 I'm going to show you a photograph --
21
                       MS.
                                      Objection,
22
                 it's not happening.
23
                                      Why?
                       MR. OGINSKI:
24
                       MS.
                                      He's not
25
                 looking at those photos.
0069
1
                                                   69
 2
                       MR. OGINSKI: Why? I have a
 3
                 number of questions. They were
 4
                 marked.
 5
                                 : He's not
                       MS.
                 looking at the photos.
 6
 7
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      Why?
 8
                                :
                                      Call the
                       MS.
 9
                 judge.
10
                       MR. OGINSKI: I want a basis,
11
                 a legal basis, otherwise I have to
12
                 make a motion. This is a patient's
13
                 condition --
14
                       MS.
                                     I don't know
15
                 who took the pictures.
```

```
16
                       MR. OGINSKI: I don't care.
                             : I don't know
17
                       MS.
18
                 when the pictures were taken. I
19
                 don't know if that's the patient. I
20
                 don't know anything about those
21
                 pictures.
22
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      Then you
23
                 haven't read the file.
2.4
                               : I don't know
                       MS.
25
                 if he is twisting his arm.
0070
1
                                                    70
2
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      You didn't read
3
                 the deposition?
4
                                      I am not
                       MS.
 5
                 having him answer questions relating
 6
                 to the photos.
 7
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      Then you have a
 8
                 problem because the doctor is going
9
                 to have to come back because you are
10
                 obstructing this unnecessarily.
11
                       MS.
                                  : I'm not. Call
12
                 the judge.
13
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      These were
14
                 marked at the plaintiff's
15
                 deposition. He testified about
16
                 them. He testified he appears in
17
                 the pictures. He discussed his
18
                 condition, what time, what date and
19
                 it indicates on the photograph when
20
                 it was taken.
21
                       I have a few questions for the
22
                 doctor about the photographs and his
23
                 own personal observations of the
24
                 patient when he was treating him and
25
                 so my questions are relatively
0071
1
 2
                 simple. And I don't understand any
3
                 objection because at trial, I can
 4
                 ask him any question I want about
 5
                 any photograph concerning this
 6
                 patient. So your objection, I
 7
                 think, is totally improper and
8
                 obstructive.
9
                       MS.
                                      Call the
10
                 judge.
11
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      I'm going to
12
                 ask the question and you can make
13
                 whatever objection you want, so I
14
                 have my basis to make the motion and
15
                 ask for cause and sanction.
16
                 Doctor, I'm going to show you a
17
     photograph of Mr.
                              taken on October 18, 2005,
18
     previously marked as Defendant's Exhibit A at
19
     plaintiff's deposition on October 4, 2006.
20
                 Did you have a chance to look at it,
21
     Doctor?
```

```
22
           Α
                 (Witness indicating.)
23
           Q
                 You have to answer verbally.
24
                 Yes.
           Α
25
                 In the photograph of Mr.
                                                       left
           Q
0072
     forearm, can you tell me based upon your examination
 3
                  on August 15th, whether his arm, before
 4
     you attempted the closed reduction, looked the way
 5
     that it appears in this photograph before you? And
 6
     by the way, there are three photographs on this
 7
     sheet.
 8
                 I don't recall.
 9
                       MS.
                                  : Objection to
10
                 you answering the question.
11
                 I'm going to show you another three
12
     photographs, again previously marked as Defendant's
13
     Exhibit B, taken on October 18, 2005, that Mr.
14
     has identified.
15
                 And I'm going to ask you the same
16
     question, is the condition that's shown in these
17
     three photographs, are they the same condition as his
18
     forearm appeared on August 15th, before you attempted
19
     the closed reduction or is it different?
20
                       MS.
                                  : Objection.
21
                 You can answer over my objection.
22
                 I told you, I don't recall.
23
                 In the first exhibit, Exhibit A, do you
24
     see there is a deformity in the left forearm, based
25
     upon the photographs?
0073
1
                                                    73
2
                       MS.
                                      Objection.
3
                 You can answer over my objection.
 4
                       Can you tell if that's a
 5
                 deformity or do you need to see the
 6
                 patient physically to tell if that's
 7
                 a deformity?
8
                       THE WITNESS: I need to see
9
                 the patient physically.
10
                 I'm asking based upon the photographs,
11
     whether you can tell me if the condition of the
12
     patient as it appears in those photographs,
13
     represents any type of deformity?
14
           Α
                 It's highly difficult.
15
                 Why is it difficult?
           Q
16
                 It's not that easy to see a photo and
     then say it's deformed or not deformed.
17
18
                 Based upon your experience and training
19
     when you see a patient, before you put your hands on
     them to examine them, you look to see whether there
20
21
     is any gross deformity; correct?
22
                 Yes.
           Α
23
                 In these photographs, the three
           Q.
     photographs that you see before you, in your opinion,
25
     Doctor, based upon a reasonable degree of medical
0074
                                                    74
1
```

```
probability, do you have an opinion as to whether
 3
     there is any type of deformity visible in these
 4
     photographs?
 5
                       MS.
                                  :
                                      Objection.
 6
                 You may answer over my objection.
 7
                       Can you tell anything from
 8
                 these photos?
 9
                 Is there any type of angulation visible
10
     in the left forearm in the three photographs?
11
                 It's difficult to say from these
12
     photographs.
                 Is there anything to suggest that there
13
           Q.
14
     is a rotational component to Mr.
                                                   forearm in
15
     those three photographs, Defendant's Exhibit A?
16
                       MS.
                                : Objection.
17
                 You may answer over my objection, if
18
                 you can tell.
19
                 I cannot.
           Α
20
                 Looking at Defendant's Exhibit B, these
           0
21
     additional three photographs, I'll ask you the same
22
     question, can you tell me from a gross standpoint,
23
     whether there is any obvious, either angulation or
24
     rotational component to Mr.
25
                       MS.
                                       Objection.
0075
1
                                                    75
 2
                 You may answer over my objection.
 3
                 It's difficult to say anything on these
 4
     photographs.
                 Is there any gross deformity visible in
 5
           Q.
 6
     these photographs to his left forearm?
 7
                       MS.
                                      Objection,
                                  :
 8
                 asked and answered. He answered the
 9
                 question. He said it's difficult to
10
                 tell.
11
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      I'm asking
12
                 based upon this exhibit, not the
13
                 first one.
14
                 Unless we examine the patient, I cannot
15
     tell you exactly what it is.
16
                I'm not asking that, Doctor.
17
     understand your comment, but I'm only asking based
18
     upon these photographs.
19
                 Can you form any opinion based upon your
20
     experience and your training, as to whether you
21
     observe any gross deformity to his left forearm,
22
     that's observable in these photographs?
23
                       MS.
                                      Can you tell
                                  :
24
                 anything from this photo?
25
                 Not from this photo, I cannot say.
           Α
0076
1
                                                    76
                 Let me show you what's been marked
 3
     previously as Defendant's Exhibit C, which are an
     additional three photographs, again taken on
 5
     October 18, 2005.
 6
                 Looking specifically at the top
     photograph, Doctor, is there any gross deformity
```

```
visible on that photograph?
 9
                                 : Objection.
                       MS.
10
                 Do you have an opinion within a
11
     reasonable degree of medical probability, as to
12
     whether there is any gross deformity that is visible
13
     on that photograph?
                 It's very difficult to just say that
14
          Α
15
     there is a gross deformity or no deformity.
16
                The condition that appears in this
17
     photograph, Doctor, was this present on August 15,
18
     2005, before you reduced the fracture?
19
                       MS.
20
                 condition?
21
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      Whatever
22
                 condition is appearing in this
23
                 photograph.
24
                                     He said it's
                 difficult to tell. What condition
25
0077
1
                                                    77
 2
                 are you referring to?
 3
                 Do you see any bump or raise in his
 4
     forearm in Exhibit C that's before you, do you see
 5
                 I see a small raise. That means nothing.
 7
                In your opinion, there is no deformity
           Q
 8
     based upon what you see in that photograph?
 9
                 I can't say exactly that it's a
     deformity. You can be -- I just can't answer that
10
11
     without seeing the patient and examination.
12
           0
                 I'm going to show you what's previously
13
     marked as Defendant's Exhibit D and that is a whole
14
     series of photographs of Mr.
                                         and his left arm.
15
                 I ask you to take a look at that. In any
16
     of the photographs shown on this sheet, Exhibit D, is
17
     there any indication, Doctor, that there is a gross
18
     deformity that appears on his left forearm?
19
                               : I'm going to
                       MS.
20
                 object again and I'm going to direct
21
                 him not to answer, only because he
22
                 said the same thing over and over
23
                 and over again.
24
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      These are
25
                 different views. These are a
0078
1
                                                    78
 2
                 different set of photographs, so I
 3
                 would like him to answer based on
                 this set of photographs.
 5
                       MS.
                                : And I'm
 6
                 directing him not to answer.
 7
                 Doctor, is there any angulation deformity
 8
     visible on any of the photographs on Defendant's
9
     Exhibit D?
10
                       MS.
                                    Can you tell
                                  :
11
                 anything from these photos?
12
                 I can't really tell if there is a real
13
     gross deformity or is it just from the photographic
```

```
14
     imaging that it shows like that, until I see the
15
     patient.
16
                 Do you think there is a way to manipulate
17
     that, to create what's seen in those photographs?
18
                      MS.
                                 : Last I
19
                 checked, he's a doctor, not a
20
                 photographer.
21
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                     He just made a
22
                 comment that he thinks there was
23
                 something in the photographs.
24
                                 : He did not.
25
                 He said he cannot tell from the
0079
                                                   79
1
2
                 photograph.
3
                      MR. OGINSKI:
                                     Because of the
 4
                 imaging process.
 5
                 Is there something in there about any of
 6
     the photographs that were taken, that suggests to you
 7
     anything?
8
          Α
                 I'm not an expert on photographing.
9
           Q
                 Being an expert in your field of
10
     medicine, Doctor, again in Exhibit D, is there
11
     anything there to suggest to you that there is some
12
     type of deformity?
13
                 Unless I see the patient and examine
          Α
14
     personally --
15
          Q
                 I'm not asking about that. I understand
16
     your comments; you made it a number of times.
17
                Can you say anything about what you
18
     observe in the photograph?
19
          A I cannot comment.
20
           Q
                Do you know Dr.
                                         , an
21
    orthopedist?
22
          Α
                No.
23
           Q
                 Do you know a Dr.
24
          Α
                No.
25
           Q
                Did you ever learn from any physician,
0800
1
 2
     that Mr.
                had an angulation deformity of
 3
     anywhere between 19 to 30 degrees?
 4
          Α
             No.
 5
          Q
                Is an angulation deformity of 30 degrees
 6
     considered to be severe --
 7
                As I told you, I'm not an orthopedic --
 8
     orthopedist and I cannot tell you exactly if that is
 9
     significant or not.
10
                Based upon your training and your
     experience, Doctor, do you know whether an angulation
11
     deformity of 30 degrees is a significant one?
12
13
                It should be significant.
          Α
14
                 Why?
           Q
15
                 I don't think there is any functional
           Α
16
     problem, unless I see the patient and examine. I
17
     cannot tell you exactly what the functional things
18
     is.
19
           Q
                 I didn't ask about functional deformity.
```

```
20
               Only for cosmetic, yes, you will see a
         Α
21
    deformity.
22
                Did you ever tell Mr.
          Q
                                             that if he
23
    has some type of deformity, as you put it, cosmetic
24
     deformity, that there is nothing to do, nothing to
25
     worry about?
0081
1
                                                  81
2
               I never told him anything like that.
3
               Did you ever suggest to Mr. if he
 4
    has any cosmetic deformity, there is always surgery
     available to him to fix the problem?
6
               I cannot specifically tell what I talked
7
     to the patient because I don't recall it. But I
8
     generally tell all my patients, as a customary
9
    practice.
10
               Did you ever see the X-ray report of
          Q
11
    August 29th, at any time after you saw Mr.
12
    August 19th?
13
               The last time I seen was on the 19th,
          Α
14
    August 19th. After that, I didn't see him, so I --
15
         Q That wasn't my question, Doctor. My
16
    question was, did you ever see any X-ray report for
17
    August 29th, at any time after you saw him on the
18
    19th of August?
19
                      MS.
                                     Did you see
20
                any X-ray reports?
21
          Α
                No.
22
          0
                Do you know who saw him on August 29th?
23
          Α
                (No response.)
                Can you turn to the August 29th clinic
          0
25
    visit?
0082
1
2
                August 29th, can you tell from that note,
3
     who saw him on that visit?
                Signature says it's Dr.
         Α
5
                And on September 23rd, when he followed
6
    up in the clinic, can you tell who saw him on that
7
    visit?
8
                It shows it's P.A.
                And to your knowledge, is P.A.
9
          Q.
10
    working at
                      Hospital?
11
         A
                Yes.
12
                Do you know P.A.
          Q
                                   first name?
13
                No.
          Α
14
               I'm sorry, Mr.
                                 , it's a man; right?
          Q
15
          Α
               Yes.
                And I think you mentioned Dr.
16
                                                              is
          Q
17
     still at
                Hospital; right?
                Yes.
18
          Α
19
                Did you see any callus formation on the
          Q
20
    X-rays that you reviewed on August 19th?
21
                August 19th, no.
22
                We have the patient's X-rays here and I
23
    know we don't have a light box, but if you can, as
    best you can, I would like you to take a look at the
24
25
    August 19th films.
```

```
0083
                                                    83
1
2
                                 : We don't have
3
                 a light box, how do you expect him
 4
                 to look at this?
5
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      He can hold it
 6
                     If he can't determine based
                 up.
7
                 upon the lights we have, let me
8
                 know.
9
                       Off the record.
10
                       (At this time, a discussion
11
                 was held off the record.)
12
                 Doctor, again, how many films are there
13
     for the 19th?
14
           Α
                 One film.
15
                 And two views?
           Q
16
                 Two views.
           Α
17
                 And do you have sufficient light to view
18
     these X-rays, Doctor?
19
           Α
                 Yes.
20
                 And can you tell from the film that you
21
    have in front of you, whether there is any callus
22
     formation in either of the two views for August 19th?
23
                 There is no callus formation.
24
                 Is there any movement of the bone
25
     fragments, in comparison to the August 15th X-rays?
0084
1
2
                 I have to look at the film.
 3
                Before we compare them, can you tell if
     there is any movement or displacement of any of the
5
    bone fragments on this film?
6
                They're near anatomical. They are not
7
     absolutely anatomical position. The bone is out to
8
     length and mild dorsal displacement of the ulna.
9
                Are you specifically referring to the
10
     view on the right side?
11
                 Yes.
           Α
12
                 And, Doctor, if the patient's bones heal
13
     in the position that is seen on the right side of
14
     this film, is it your opinion that that's an
15
     acceptable method or acceptable manner of healing?
16
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      I'll rephrase
17
                 it.
18
                 Is the patient going to be left with any
19
    physical deformity if the bone heals in the manner in
20
     which it's shown in the film on the right side?
21
                I don't see any problem in healing.
22
     will be fine if it heals that way.
23
                 With that deformity that you mentioned,
           Q
24
     you said angular?
25
                 I didn't say angulation. I said
0085
1
     displacement, that will correct. It's not a problem.
3
                And you characterize that as a mild
           Q
4
     displacement?
           Α
                 Yes.
```

```
Can you look, please, at the
7
     pre-reduction films of August 15th?
                 There are two films; correct?
8
9
           Α
                 Yes.
10
                 And which is the AP view?
           0
11
                 This is the AP view (indicating).
           Α
12
                 Can you tell from the AP view, whether
           0
13
     there is any rotational deformity that's visible on
14
     that film?
15
                 I don't see any rotational deformity.
          Α
16
                Is there any angulation deformity?
           Q
17
           Α
                There is angulation.
18
           Q
                 In which bone do you see the angulation?
19
           Α
                 Both bones.
20
                 Both the ulna and the radius?
           Q
21
           Α
                 Yes.
22
                 Can you quantify that amount?
           Q
23
                 I can't exactly say without sets to
           Α
24
     measure the angles.
25
           Q
                 Can you approximate, your best estimate,
0086
1
                                                    86
 2
     Doctor?
 3
                 Approximately, probably around 20
           Α
     degrees.
 5
                 And in both bones or one?
           Q
 6
                 In both bones, around 20, 25.
           Α
 7
           Q
                 And can you look at the lateral film,
 8
     please?
9
                 Yes.
10
                       MR. OGINSKI: Off the record.
11
                       (At this time, a discussion
12
                 was held off the record.)
13
                 In looking at the lateral film, can you
14
     see any angulation deformity in that film?
15
                 I don't see any angulation deformity, but
16
     there is displacement of the ulna.
17
                 Can you quantify that or characterize it?
18
                 Not at this overlapping -- it does show
19
     it's displaced. How much of it is in contact, I
20
     don't know.
                 If you could take a look at the
21
22
     post-reduction films, there appear to be four of
23
     them?
24
                 I think they made two copies of each.
25
     Yes, there are two copies of each. When it printed
0087
1
                                                    87
     out, it made it that way. They're the same.
 3
                 And on the AP view, Doctor, is there any
           Q
     angulation deformity still visible on either of the
 5
     two bones?
                 In the ulna, I see about less than five
 7
     degrees and the radius looks normal.
           0
                 Is that within accepted standards?
9
                 That's accepted standards.
           Α
10
                 And the lateral film, do you see any
11
     angulation or rotational deformity?
```

```
12
                 No, I don't see any.
           Α
13
                 Do you see displacement?
           Q
14
                 I see a displacement of about five to ten
           Α
15
     percent in the ulna. Radius looks normal.
16
                 And it was your opinion that that is
17
     going to heal without any functional or cosmetic
18
     deformity --
19
           Α
                 Yes.
20
                 (Continuing)
           Q
                              In that manner?
21
           Α
                 Yes.
22
                 In your experience, Doctor, in treating
23
     patients with this type of fracture, both the ulna
24
     and the radius, what has been your experience as far
25
     as the results when using closed reduction, as
0088
                                                    88
 1
 2
     opposed to open reduction?
 3
                 I had good results both ways, both
 4
     closed, as well as open reductions.
 5
                 Were there occasions in your experience
 6
     where the results have not been optimal using closed
 7
     reduction for this type of fracture?
 8
                 Very little, like one percent.
           Α
 9
                 If bones heal in anatomic misalignment,
10
     what happens to the function of the bones or the body
11
     part?
12
                       MS.
                                      What degree of
13
                 misalignment are we talking about,
14
                 any misalignment?
15
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      Yes.
16
                       MS.
                                  : Five percent,
17
                 ten percent, I don't know, fifty
18
                 percent?
19
                 Can you tell me if the bones heal in an
20
     incorrect alignment --
21
                                      What degree
                       MS.
22
                 are we referring to? I need
23
                 clarification on that question.
24
                 Are there occasions when bones will heal
25
     in an incorrect alignment, which will cause a
0089
 1
                                                    89
 2
     functional deformity?
 3
           Α
                It depends upon how much of misalignment
 4
     is there. Yes, it can cause.
 5
                And customarily, how much misalignment do
 6
     you tend to see with a functional deformity?
 7
                 Evaluate the patient and see what
     functional deformity he has and depending on that, we
 9
     advise him what to do.
10
                 Are there patients who can experience a
11
     functional deformity with a minimal misalignment and
12
     others who have a functional deformity with a larger
13
     misalignment?
14
                       MS.
                                      Again, what is
                                  :
15
                 minimal?
16
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                      I don't know,
17
                 I'll ask the doctor.
```

```
18
                               : Are you asking
19
                 the doctor to tell what you minimal
20
                 is?
21
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                     Yes.
22
                 As I told you, I have to examine the
23
     patient and see what happens, you know. I'm not an
     authority on fractures and their healing. But what I
24
25
     see from the patients, that's what I can translate to
0090
1
                                                    90
2
     you.
 3
                 Going back to your initial examination of
    Mr.
                on August 15th, when you spoke to
 5
                    about your evaluation of the patient, did
     Dr.
 6
                    disagree with your assessment based upon
 7
     the information you gave him?
8
                I don't recollect.
          Α
                 If he had recommended based upon what you
9
10
     told him, that the patient have an open reduction to
     correct his fracture, would you have somehow either
11
12
     scheduled him or told the patient about that?
13
                 Definitely.
          Α
14
                 And if a decision was made by Dr.
15
     that the patient needed open reduction, you mentioned
16
     that he would not have had surgery that day, he would
17
    have been told to come back on a different day?
18
          Δ
                 Yes.
19
                 Did you ever learn from anyone, any
           Q
20
    medical doctor, and I'm not talking about your
21
     attorney, that Mr.
                               required an osteotomy five
22
    months after he was treated at
                                           Hospital, to
     correct the condition of his arm?
23
2.4
                 This is the first time I'm hearing about
           Α
25
     the patient.
0091
1
 2
                 If you participate in an open reduction
3
     procedure, do you typically follow the patient
 4
     postoperatively, when they come back for follow-ups?
 5
                As far as possible. It's the whole team.
 6
     It is whoever gets to see him, will see him. If
 7
     there is any abnormality, the surgeon who has
 8
     operated would be informed.
 9
          Q
                Do you have an opinion as you sit here
10
     today, as to whether if Mr.
                                       had had an open
11
     reduction initially, after being seen in the
12
     emergency room at
                              Hospital, as to whether
13
     the condition of his fracture would have been better
14
     or remained the same?
15
                 I cannot answer that.
           Α
16
                 If a patient --
           Q
17
                                    Better than
                       MS.
18
                 what?
19
                 If a patient undergoes an open reduction,
20
     is there anyway for the bones to move at that point,
21
     since you now have hardware fixing the fracture?
22
                I didn't follow the patient too long.
          A
23
                 I'm asking as a general question, Doctor,
```

```
if a patient has an open reduction with hardware, are
25
     the bones then fixed with the hardware?
0092
                                                   92
1
2
           Α
                 Yes.
3
                 And not movable; correct?
           Q
          Α
                 Yes.
 5
                 And do you have an opinion as to whether
           Q
 6
                  had had an open reduction initially,
     if Mr.
 7
     whether his outcome would have been the same as it
8
     ultimately was?
9
                       MS.
                                      Objection.
10
                 didn't see the patient after the
11
                 19th and I'm not going to have him
12
                 answer that question. I'm sure you
13
                 hired an expert.
14
           Q
                 Do you know Dr. Giddumal?
15
           Α
                 No.
16
          0
                 Did you ever review Dr. Giddumal's report
17
     of his examination of this patient --
18
          Α
                No.
19
                 (Continuing) In 2006?
           Q
20
           Α
21
                 Did you have any conversation with
           Q.
22
     Physician Assistant Oken about Mr.
23
          Α
                 I don't recall.
24
                 Was Mr.
                                     case ever presented at
25
     rounds, either in the department of orthopedics or
0093
1
 2
     any other department, for any reason whatsoever?
3
                 I don't recall.
          Α
4
                Did you ever speak with Mr.
           Q.
                                                   at any
 5
     time after August 19, 2005?
 6
                I don't recall seeing him.
7
                When you saw him on August 15th in the
8
     emergency room at
                              Hospital, was anyone with
9
    him at the time?
10
                I don't recall.
          Α
11
                When you saw him on August 19, 2005 in
12
     the orthopedic clinic, was anyone with him at the
13
     time of your examination?
          A I don't recall.
14
15
           0
                Did you prescribe Mr. any pain
16
     medication on August 19th?
17
          A I don't recall.
18
                Going back to your note, Doctor, on
19
     August 19th, whose signature appears next to yours?
20
                That's mine. This is my signature, then
          Α
    my number (indicating).
21
22
                Did you have a conversation with
23
                on August 19th about any other treatment
     options, besides continuing to watch and observe him?
24
25
                It's customary procedure.
0094
1
                                                   94
 2
                 I'm not asking customary. I'm asking
     specific conversation that you had with him?
```

```
I don't recall.
          Α
5
                 On August 19th when you examined him in
     the orthopedic clinic, were his fingers visible
7
     through the cast or before the cast ended?
8
                 The type of cast I put in, they should be
9
     visible.
10
          0
                 Did you ask him if he had any problems
11
    with his fingers, either movement or sensation?
12
                It's customary to ask.
          Α
13
           Q
                I asked, did you ask him?
14
                I don't recall.
15
                Is there anything in your note of
16
     August 19th, to suggest whether you did or didn't ask
17
    him those questions?
18
                 There is nothing to denote. I didn't
19
     write that specifically.
20
                And do you have any memory of asking him
21
     either about sensation or motor control for the 19th?
22
                It's customary for me ask every patient
          Α
23
    who comes.
24
          Q
                 And what were the results of that?
25
           Α
                Must be normal, that's why I didn't note
0095
1
                                                    95
 2
     it down.
 3
                 The fact that that information is not
     contained within your note, there could be two
 5
     reasons for that; right, either you didn't ask and
 6
     didn't write it down or it was normal and didn't
 7
     write it down; correct?
 8
                 That's correct.
           Α
9
                You had mentioned in your emergency room
10
     note, your consult note of August 15th, that you had
11
     discussed with the patient surgery versus
12
     conservative care.
13
                 And in your opinion, the conservative
14
     care represented the closed reduction?
15
                Closed reduction.
          Α
16
                And what did you tell the patient about
          Q
17
     surgery?
18
                 That he will need two incisions to be
19
    made on his forearm. This is customary that I talk
20
     to every patient. And we put plates and screws at
21
     the fracture site and so that they heal in proper
22
     anatomical position.
23
                 He also has to know about different
24
     complications, like nerve injury and infection and
25
     the complications from anesthesia itself and it's not
0096
1
                                                    96
 2
     just limited to them, it can be --
 3
          Q Did you tell Mr.
                                         what the success
 4
     rate was of an attempted closed reduction?
 5
                 Looking at his X-rays, I said you have a
          Α
 6
     50/50 chance.
           Q
                Of what?
 8
                Of healing without surgery. If it
 9
     doesn't heal, you will still need surgery done.
```

```
10
               And did you tell him how much time he
11
    would have to make that decision or to make that
12
     determination?
13
                 I did tell him that within 10 to 14 days
14
     is the maximum that we can allow before we can do the
15
     surgery without much complications. That's my
16
     customary.
17
          Q
                Did you ever tell Mr.
                                             that you
18
     don't handle workers' compensation cases?
19
                Pardon?
          Α
20
                Did you ever tell Mr.
21
    emergency room, that your hospital does not handle
    patients who have workers' compensation cases or
22
    something to that effect?
23
              I don't recall.
24
          A
25
          Q
                Does
                            Hospital, to your
0097
1
                                                   97
 2
     knowledge, handle patients who have workers'
 3
     compensation cases?
 4
               In the orthopedic clinic, we do not
          A
 5
    because we are not in the compensation board, board
 6
     of doctors.
7
                 So if a patient needed treatment and they
          Q.
    were a workers' compensation case, what would they do
9
     to get additional care and treatment?
1 0
                We advise them to seek a compensation
11
     doctor and give him the numbers where they can get
12
     the doctors who can take care. And ask them to go
13
     right away, do not delay. We don't deny treatment to
14
     them.
15
                 I understand. Did Mr.
                                              tell you
     that he wanted to have surgery because he didn't want
16
17
     to have to go through the healing process twice?
18
                I don't recall.
19
                How long does this type of fracture take
          Q.
20
     to heal, Doctor?
21
                You mean --
          Α
22
               The fractures that you observed on
23
     August 15th, how long does it typically take to heal?
24
          A Six weeks is the customary period for it
25
     to -- for the casting.
0098
1
                                                   98
2
                And if the patient has open reduction to
3
     fix the fractures, how long does that take to heal,
     assuming no complications?
 5
                For any fracture, the bone takes three
 6
     months to heal completely, whether you do an open
 7
     reduction or a closed reduction.
8
                You just told me a moment ago it takes
9
     six weeks to heal?
10
                 The cast --
11
                      MS.
                                      He said six
                                  :
12
                 weeks for the cast.
13
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                     That wasn't my
14
                 question.
15
          Q
                 With closed reduction, how long does it
```

```
16
     take for these types of fractures, the type that
17
                experienced, to heal?
18
                                : Completely
                       MS.
19
                 heal?
20
                       MR. OGINSKI:
                                     Yes.
21
                 Completely heal, three months.
22
           0
                 And the same could be said if he had open
23
     reduction; correct?
24
                 Three months for the bone to heal
          Α
25
     completely.
0099
1
                                                   99
 2
                How did you reduce this fracture?
 3
                I don't recall specifically.
 4
                How do you reduce this type of fracture?
           Q
 5
                This had minimal angulation, so I just
          Α
 6
     hang the hand and then apply the cast and manipulate
 7
     it or what do you call that, re-model the cast
 8
     carefully so that the angulation is corrected.
 9
                Before you apply the cast, do you
          Q
10
     manipulate the arm?
11
                Yes. That's what I'm saying, I hang up
          Α
12
     the hand (indicating).
13
                 To apply traction?
           Q.
14
                 To apply traction and then manipulate and
15
     correct the angulation and then apply the cast and
16
     then re-model.
17
                 How do you know in what position to put
18
     it in, is what I'm asking?
19
                 That's why I look at the X-ray. That's
20
     why I want to look at the X-ray and see which way I
21
     have to move.
22
          Q
                 And when you apply the cast, do you angle
23
     the elbow?
24
                 In other words, do you leave it straight;
25
     how do you set the arm?
0100
1
 2
                Hang it up at 90 degrees like this, so I
 3
     can put some weight over here (indicating).
 4
               Once you reduce the fracture, the arm is
          Q
 5
     casted in a 90 degree angle at the elbow?
 6
          Α
             At the elbow.
 7
                Do you have any memory of actually
 8
     reducing this particular patient?
 9
          A I don't recollect.
10
                 Did ever see Mr.
11
     had been removed, when he was last seen in the
12
     orthopedic clinic, either in passing or somewhere in
13
     the orthopedic clinic?
14
                 I don't recollect seeing him.
15
                 Did you ever see Mr.
                                                 arm after
16
     his cast had been finally removed?
17
                                 : He just
                       MS.
18
                 testified he never saw him. How is
19
                 he going to see his arm if he never
20
                 saw him?
21
           Q
                 Did you ever speak to the physician's
```

```
assistant after the cast had been removed?
23
           A I don't recollect.
24
                Did the physician's assistant ever
           Q
25
     indicate to you that he had any type of swelling
0101
1
 2
     after his cast was finally removed on September 23rd?
3
           A I don't recollect.
4
                 Do you know what type of work Mr.
5
     did?
6
                 I don't recollect exactly what he told.
7
     Only from the note, I can say some bricks fell on his
8
     hand.
9
                Other than your consult note, Doctor, for
     August 15, 2005, did you write any other note on
10
11
     August 15th in the emergency room?
12
                No.
           Α
13
                 Did you write any note that does not
     appear within this record, something you may have
14
15
     written, for whatever reason didn't make it into the
16
     chart?
17
                I don't have a habit.
          Α
18
                I'm not asking habit, I'm asking
19
     specifically in this case.
20
           Α
                I don't recall.
21
           Q
                Are you, as a special fellow, permitted
22
     to prescribe medication to patients?
23
           A As a physician, yes.
24
           Q
                As a special fellow working at
25
     Hospital?
0102
1
                                                    102
           A I'm a physician, so I can prescribe.
Q Do you have privileges to see or admit
2
3
 4
     patients to
                      Hospital, separate and apart
 5
     from anybody you may see either in a clinic or in the
 6
     emergency room?
 7
                I never ask for that, so I cannot answer
           Α
8
     that.
9
                 Do you work at any other hospital besides
10
           Hospital?
11
                No.
12
                 From 2005 up until the present, have you
           0
13
     ever worked at any other hospital?
1 4
          Α
               No.
15
                       (Continued on the next page.)
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
0103
1
                                                    103
```

```
Q Has your employment with
3
   Hospital changed at all from 2005, up until the
    present time?
 5
       A No.
6
                      MR. OGINSKI: Thank you. (Time noted: 12:40 p.m.)
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
     Sworn and subscribed to me before
14
    this_____day of______, 20__.
15
16
    NOTARY PUBLIC
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
0104
1
                                                     104
2
3
4
        INDEX TO EXHIBITS
5
   Plaintiff's
    __Exhibits_ Description
                                          For I.D.
6
       1
                 Chart
                                           pg. 12
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
0105
1
                                                     105
2
                           ERRATA SHEET
                  VERITEXT/NEW YORK REPORTING, LLC
   1-800-727-6396
200 OLD COUNTRY ROAD 1350 BROADWAY
MINEOLA, NEW YORK 11501 NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10018
3
```

5 6	NAME OF CASE: VS. DATE OF DEPOSITION: APRIL 4, 2007		
7	NAME OF DEPONENT: , M.D.		
8 9 10 11 12	PAGE LINE (S) CHANGE	REASON	
13 14 15 16 17 18 19			
20 21 22	(NAME OF WITNESS) SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO BEFORE ME THISDAY OF, 20		
23 24 25 0106 1 2	(NOTARY PUBLIC) MY COMMISSION EXPIRES 106 CERTIFICATE		
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	I, JENNIFER BRENNAN, a Notary within and for the State of New York certify: THAT, the witness whose testi hereinbefore set forth, was duly swo THAT, the within transcript i of the testimony given by such witned I further certify that I am nof the parties to this action, by bland that I am in no way interested in the matter. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have he hand this day of	he witness whose testimony is et forth, was duly sworn by me; and, he within transcript is a true record my given by such witness. er certify that I am not related to any to this action, by blood or marriage, in no way interested in the outcome of ESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my	